

TRUSTEES OF THE PUBLIC LIBRARY OF THE CITY OF BOSTON

Meeting of the Trustees Finance and Audit Committee

Thursday, June 18, 2015 / 8:00 a.m.

Commonwealth Salon, Central Library

700 Boylston Street, Boston, MA 02116

MINUTES

A meeting of the Boston Public Library Trustees Finance and Audit Committee was held on Thursday, June 18, 2015 at 8:00 a.m. at the Boston Public Library, Central Library, Commonwealth Salon, 700 Boylston Street, Boston, MA 02116.

Present at the meeting were Finance and Audit Committee Chair Evelyn Arana-Ortiz and Committee members Rep. Byron Rushing, Zamawa Arenas, and John Hailer.

Also present were Boston Public Library Staff: President Amy Ryan, Director of Administration and Technology David Leonard, Chief Financial Officer Ellen Donaghey, Budget and Procurement Manager Edward Maheigan, and Clerk of the Board Deborah Kirrane. Attending from City of Boston were Corporation Counsel Caroline Driscoll and Management Analyst Edward Pesce.

Ms. Arana-Ortiz, Chair of the Trustees Finance and Audit Committee (“Committee”) presiding, called the meeting to order at 8:00 a.m. and addressed the review and approval of minutes of prior meetings: September 11, 2014 and March 5, 2015. Because there was not a quorum present at the April 28, 2015 meeting, there were no minutes for the Committee to approve and instead Ms. Arana-Ortiz referred the Committee to the notes of that meeting.

On a motion made and duly seconded, the Minutes of the Trustees Finance and Audit Committee Meetings of September 11, 2014 and March 5, 2015 were approved.

Ms. Arana-Ortiz introduced the next agenda item and asked for review and discussion of the proposed Contract for Furnishing Guard and Patrol Services. She asked BPL Director of Administration and Technology, David Leonard, to brief the Committee on bid, evaluation, and selection processes related to the contract before the Committee.

Mr. Leonard explained that the original Guard and Patrol Services Request for Proposals (“RFP”) had a technical deficiency and thus had to be re-bid. As part of the re-bid process, the RFP was enhanced to better address employee benefit and technical requirements. Seven respondents, the same seven respondents from the original RFP, provided proposals. An evaluation committee comprised of Mr. Leonard, Director of Facilities James Meade, Director of Security Paul Levasseur, and Director of Branch Libraries Christine Schonhart reviewed non-price proposals and rated the seven respondents. Two respondents were rated highly advantageous, two were rated advantageous, and three were rated non-advantageous. The evaluation committee next reviewed the price proposals as submitted by the seven respondents and further asked the two highly advantageous respondents clarifying-type questions. Upon review of price, non-price, and further questioning, together with review from City of Boston Legal Department, the BPL evaluation committee recommended to the Trustees Finance and Audit Committee that the Contract for Furnishing Guard and Patrol Services be awarded to G4S Secure Solutions, Inc.

In response to questioning by Rep. Rushing, Mr. Leonard reported that the Boston Public Library does not have any past experience with G4S Secure Solutions, and they would replace the current vendor, Andy Frain Security.

Ms. Arana-Ortiz asked to see the evaluating criteria used by the Evaluation Committee and read the following criteria for the Committee:

- 1.1 Vendor has previous experience within the past 5 years, similar contracts, including providing security services at a minimum of ten locations for an individual client.
- 1.2 Proposal includes references for at least three (3) clients with projects of a similar size and scope.
- 1.3 Vendor to have been in business for a minimum of five (5) years in providing security services.
- 1.4 The vendor agrees to provide additional hours of Guard and Patrol Service as called upon by the BPL to do so.
- 1.5 The vendor agrees to provide training for each individual assigned to the BPL, as outlined in the RFP.
- 1.6 The vendor as an Employee Health Insurance Program.
- 1.7 Vendor will provide on-site point of contact during regular service hours (main shift).
- 1.8 Vendor will provide off-site escalation point of contract for (other shifts/after hours).
- 1.9 Vendor will participate in quarterly review of performance, and take action on any identified remediation steps.

Mr. Leonard left the meeting to retrieve the full proposal from his office, and Ms. Arana-Ortiz asked that the Committee address the next agenda item: Contract to Conserve and Restore Pierre Puvis de Chavannes' *Philosophy* (1895/6). She pointed the Trustees to the Conservation Assessment Report as prepared by Gianfranco Pocobene, described same as a detailed and informative document and reported that the entire mural will have to be removed in order to effectuate proper repair. Ms. Donaghey reminded the Committee that public bid process would be waived for this contract, given its emergency nature and the unique skill set required to correctly repair and conserve the mural. Ms. Driscoll confirmed that this was appropriate. The Committee discussed the cost of \$150,000 and found it reasonable given the description of the work in the Conservation Assessment Report.

Ms. Donaghey explained that because damage to the mural was caused by gradual deterioration and not a single catastrophic event, the cost of restoration would not be covered by insurance. The *Philosophy* mural is the only mural requiring restoration.

The conservator, Gianfranco Pocobene, has performed additional work at Central Library, notably the restoration of the Sargent murals. Ms. Ryan explained that Gianfranco Pocobene also plans to dust and perform minor repairs on other murals and that the BPL would like to eventually arrange a contract so that minor restoration services may be performed on an ongoing basis.

Upon motion made and duly seconded, the Committee unanimously:

VOTED: “that the Trustees Finance and Audit Committee approve entering into a contract with Gianfranco Pocobene Studio, Inc., 193 Maple Street, Malden, MA 02148, to Conserve and Restore the Pierre Puvis de Chavannes’ Philosphy (1895/6) Panel in McKim Building, Central Library, at a total cost not to exceed one hundred fifty thousand dollars (\$150,000).

Mr. Leonard returned to the meeting and provided the Committee with GS4 Secure Solutions’ list of client references, both library and non-library related. G4S is a national company with a regional office in Waltham, MA. The RFP criteria included enhanced benefit requirements such as providing health insurance, dental insurance, a living wage and, in particular, the ability of the respondents to provide credible health coverage meeting or exceeding Massachusetts state standards. Other evaluative criteria included whether the respondent provided a paid time off program, grievance procedure and process, and an employee ethics policy. G4S met and/or exceeded the evaluative criteria.

G4S will provide Guard and Patrol Services. Additional security considerations, i.e., technical enhancements, equipment, etc., will be forthcoming and evaluated at that time.

Mr. Leonard reported that Central Library and about half of the branches currently have security guards assigned. BPL is responsive to the needs of the front line library staff and continually reviews which branches may or may not require security guard services.

Upon motion made and duly seconded, the Committee unanimously:

VOTED: “that, there be entered into with G4S Secure Solutions, Inc., 281 Winter Street, Waltham, MA 02451, the most responsive and responsible bidder in a public Request for Proposal process advertised under G.L. c. 30B, a contract for furnishing Guard and Patrol Services for the Boston Public Library for a multi-year period beginning September 1, 2015 through June 30, 2016, and on July 1, 2016, and on July 1, 2017, at a total cost for the thirty-four (34) month period not to exceed two million, three hundred sixty three thousand, nine hundred thirty five dollars and fourteen cents (\$2,363,935.14). The cost for the first ten (10) month period, September 1, 2015 through June 30, 2015, is not to exceed six hundred seventy nine thousand, five hundred seventy nine dollars and seventy four cents (\$679,579.74) and, for Fiscal Year 2017, not to exceed eight hundred thirty six thousand, two hundred thirteen dollars and fifty six cents (\$836,213.56) and, for Fiscal Year 2018, eight hundred forty eight thousand, one hundred forty one dollars and eighty four cents (\$848,141.84). The Boston Public Library Evaluation Committee performed an evaluation of the proposals presented by seven vendors as described in the Request for Proposal, and through this process determined the proposal presented by G4S Secure Solutions, Inc., represented the most advantageous proposal for the Boston Public Library.”

The Committee next asked for an update regarding the Retail Tenant Advisory Committee process. Ms. Donaghey explained that RFP responses have been extended to July 22 and, based on that date, meetings of the Retail Tenant Advisory Committee will be scheduled. Ms. Arenas asked that the process not be rushed. Ms. Donaghey reported that a description of the evaluation and selection process, together with appropriate dates, would be sent to the members of the Retail Tenant Advisory Committee, ensuring a realistic timeframe on which an appropriate decision regarding the selection of a retail tenant can be reached.

Noting that all members of the Retail Tenant Advisory Committee may favor one candidate over another, the Finance and Audit Committee members asked that a third-party validator be consulted to serve as an independent and unbiased overseer to the final decision. Ms. Donaghey agreed to look into selecting such an independent advisor and will report to the Retail Tenant Advisory Committee of same.

The Finance and Audit Committee will not meet again until after the end of July, pending receipt of the Retail Tenant Advisory Committee information.

With no further business, meeting was adjourned at 8:28 a.m.

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Deborah A. Kirrane".

Deborah A. Kirrane, Clerk of the Board